



---

Review

Author(s): Raymond Ammann

Review by: Raymond Ammann

Source: *Yearbook for Traditional Music*, Vol. 39 (2007), pp. 170-172

Published by: [International Council for Traditional Music](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20465019>

Accessed: 06-01-2016 00:22 UTC

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



*International Council for Traditional Music* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Yearbook for Traditional Music*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

On the practical topics of transcription and analysis, McLean has much of interest to say, and I will assign this section of the book in a course I teach on the topic. He mounts an effective case for “standard transcription” as against machine transcriptions, but then joins George List in making exaggerated claims for its reliability, ignoring the filtering process of similarly trained minds and not taking seriously the potential for differences of perception depending on training as developed in studies by Pandora Hopkins and others. He is convincing on the problems with transcriptions that are too detailed and with analyses of vocal music that make unsupportable claims about the systematic use of microtonal intervals.

In the end, he concludes with a pessimistic assessment of the current state of ethnomusicology. Rather than a productive fusion, which was the promise of the “middle years,” of the anthropological and musical approaches, he believes that “the least important and least productive elements have survived from both camps and now predominate” and there has been a similar unproductive shift “from the descriptive to the theoretical, from the ‘what’ and ‘where’ to the ‘how’ and ‘why’” (p. 331). “Ethnomusicologists are currently less at the crossroads than lost in the wilderness” (p. 335). He longs for a unified discipline, but doesn’t tell us what form that unity might take. He laments its fissioning along a plethora of thematic and extra-disciplinary lines and its embrace of popular music. Worst of all, “American ethnomusicology is now awash with theory” when some solid, straightforward musical description is what is really needed (p. 337):

There are many hundreds, if not thousands of music cultures that have never received such treatment; there are others now in need of revisiting and re-study in order better to understand the processes of change; and there are entire music cultures and systems that have never been described or analysed at all ... Is the end-product of music-making really so unimportant? Aren’t people curious about *music* any more? Are the present-day antecedents of future styles of no interest? It is work crying out to be done. Why not do it? (p. 338)

Though McLean’s description of the field as it is today may have some merit, his assessment of it, his theory of it if you will, suffers from a lack of engagement with its full breadth, which in his view is part of the problem. Many of us, including McLean in his better moments I suspect, would like to have it both ways: the what and where and the how and why; the theory and the description; and the music, the behaviour, and the culture.

TIMOTHY RICE

**Ziegler, Susanne.** *Die Wachszylinder des Berliner Phonogramm-Archivs.* Veröffentlichungen des Ethnologischen Museums Berlin, n. F. 73. Berlin: Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, 2006. 512 pp., photographs, bibliographical references, discography, appendices, indexes, CD recording.

Every ethnomusicologist knows of the vital role the Berlin Phonogramm-Archiv (hereafter, Archive) played in the history of our field. Although the Archive’s col-

lections preserve many recent sound carriers, Ziegler's publication concentrates exclusively on those of wax cylinders, covering the time period from 1893 to 1954. These collections include the earliest research materials of *Vergleichende Musikwissenschaft*.

As curator of the Phonogramm-Archiv since 1993, Ziegler knows the collections very well. She is responsible for them and has published extensively on the topic. However, this book is unique; because it presents such a large variety of information on the collections it could be called a history book of the Archive, which celebrated its centenary in 2000. Ziegler's book is a catalogue of the collections, with a list of short biographical notes on the early researchers and collectors, in addition to many useful appendices. Although the main body of the book is written in German, the key parts are translated into English.

After the preface written by Lars-Christian Koch, the head of the department of ethnomusicology at the Ethnological Museum in Berlin, the author explains the background of this publication. In 1998 the Phonogramm-Archiv launched a five-year project for the preservation of their collections: "Rescuing the largest collection of old sound documents of traditional music from around the world—Restoring and re-recording the famous collections of wax cylinders and shellac records of the Berlin Phonogramm-Archiv." This project was realized with the financial support of the Stiftung Preußischer Kulturbesitz and the Stiftung Deutsche Klassenlotterie Berlin. Ziegler's publication was written as part of this project.

Ziegler divides the activities of the early Phonogramm-Archiv into five time periods:

(a) 1893–1914: the Archive consisted mainly of recordings of foreign musicians made during their visits to Europe or Germany; most of these recordings were made by Stumpf, Abraham, and Hornbostel themselves;

(b) 1915–18: recordings made in German prison camps during World War I; music and language samples of the war prisoners;

(c) 1919–33: travellers and expeditions were furnished with a phonograph to record the music of foreign cultures; as Germany lost her overseas territories during World War I, there were fewer recordings coming in from these regions; in 1922 the Phonogramm-Archiv became part of the State Academic School of Music (Staatliche Akademische Hochschule für Musik) and much energy was devoted to public relations, for example, the production of the "Demonstration Collection," a compilation of 120 wax cylinders with recordings from around the globe;

(d) 1934–44: field recordings collected until the Archive's evacuation in 1945; Hornbostel and Sachs left Nazi Germany and Marius Schneider was appointed director;

(e) 1945–91: the Archive was evacuated; one part was brought to East Berlin, and only in 1991 was this part again integrated into the Phonogramm-Archiv, now located in the Museum of Ethnology (Ethnologisches Museum) Dahlem in Berlin.

The catalogue of the 351 wax-cylinder collections, arranged in alphabetical order according to the collector's name (pp. 79–323), gives complete information: number and name of the collection, collector, place of recording, year, region, ethnic group, contents, number of wax cylinders, available cylinders, missing cyl-

inders, documentation, reference literature, and comments. Very helpful and of much interest are the old photos, transcriptions, sketches, etc., provided for many collections.

On pp. 329–91, short biographical notes for each collector are presented, and many have photographs. Reading this part was a particular pleasure for me. Here the personal backgrounds of the collectors are provided—behind each name written on the wax-cylinder boxes, an individual human life appears. I can imagine that this section demanded a great deal of research from the author, but it will be much appreciated by readers.

The various appendices provide colour pictures of the equipment, a glossary (mainly concerning the various terms and spellings of places and regions), a huge bibliography, discography, list of Internet addresses, and several indices.

Of special value to Ziegler's publication, however, is the CD-ROM (in an envelope glued to the back endpaper). This includes musical examples and a catalogue as a PDF file. The sound examples number seventy-three wax cylinder recordings as WAV files, most of them previously unpublished and selected to illustrate the diversity of the collections. On many of the recordings the collectors themselves announce the music—thus providing, for example, a unique occasion to hear Hornbostel's voice. The catalogue in PDF format on the CD-ROM runs to about a thousand pages; it is heavily based on the original catalogue of the Phonogramm-Archiv and includes the numbers and names as in the original. Scans of mostly handwritten documents by the collectors are also included.

Thus Ziegler's *Die Wachsylinder des Berliner Phonogramm-Archivs* gives us the unique chance to look at a very detailed catalogue of ethnomusicology's earliest recordings and to listen to many sound examples. It is an exceptional document on the history of *Vergleichende Musikwissenschaft* and a very useful and much appreciated tool for every library and scholar in the field.

RAYMOND AMMANN

**Marett, Allan. *Songs, Dreamings, and Ghosts: The Wangga of North Australia*.**

Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 2005. xxiii, 292 pp., photographs, maps, figures, tables, musical examples, bibliography, notes, CD, index.

This book began, as the author states on p. 3, as a project to describe a major genre of Australian Aboriginal ceremonial music, originating in the Daly River region of Northwest Australia and known over a wider area. Over the course of fifteen years' research the project matured into a deep engagement with the peoples, performers, and cultures of the region, and a close analysis of musical style, structure, and performance. The result is a brilliant synthesis of ethnographic and analytical approaches to music that deserves to be read by anyone interested in what music means.

The book begins with three scene-setting chapters covering the principal repertoires of *wangga*, the cosmological belief-systems that they embody, traditions of